Sandra Gale Behrle (SGB-4652) COOPER BROWN & BEHRLE, P.C. 331 Madison Avenue – 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor New York, NY 10017 Telephone: 212/957-9000

 Telephone:
 212/957-9000

 Facsimile:
 212/843-9191

 Email:
 cbblaw@aol.com

David K. Monroe GALLAND KHARASCH GREENBERG FELLMAN & SWIRSKY, PC 1054 Thirty-First Street, NW – Suite 200 Washington, DC 20007 Telephone: 202/342-5200

Telephone: 202/342-5200 Facsimile: 202/342-5219

Email: <u>dmonroe@gkglaw.com</u>

Attorneys for Defendant PRODPROGRAMMA IMPULS LTD.

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
Southern District of New York

STARLIGHT MARITIME LTD.,

Plaintiff,
-against
PRODPROGRAMMA IMPULS LTD.,

Defendant.

Defendant.

# ANSWER OF DEFENDANT PRODPROGRAMMA IMPULS LTD.

Defendant Prodprogramma Impuls Ltd. ("Prodprogramma"), by and through its undersigned attorneys, hereby appears on a restricted and limited basis pursuant to Rule E of the Supplemental Rules for Admiralty or Maritime Claims, and responds to the Verified Complaint filed herein against it as follows:

- Defendant Prodprogramma admits the allegations set forth in ¶ 1 of the Verified 1. Complaint.
- 2. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 2 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 2 of the Verified Complaint.
- 3. Defendant Prodprogramma admits that it is a foreign corporation with an office in Russia, and denies the remaining allegations of ¶ 3 of the Verified Complaint.
- 4. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 4 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 4 of the Verified Complaint.
- 5. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 5 of the Verified Complaint.
- 6. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 6 of the Verified Complaint.
- 7. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 7 of the Verified Complaint.
- 8. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 8 of the Verified Complaint.
- 9. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 9 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 9 of the Verified Complaint.

- 10. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 10 of the Verified Complaint.
- 11. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 11 of the Verified Complaint.
- 12. Defendant Prodprogramma admits the allegations set forth in ¶ 12 of the Verified Complaint.
- 13. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 13 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 13 of the Verified Complaint.
- 14. Defendant Prodprogramma denies the allegations set forth in ¶ 14 of the Verified Complaint.
- 15. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 15 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 15 of the Verified Complaint.
- 16. Defendant Prodprogramma admits that it cannot be found in this District, and denies the remaining allegations set forth in ¶ 16 of the Verified Complaint.
- 17. Defendant Prodprogramma does not have sufficient knowledge or information to admit or deny the allegations set forth in ¶ 17 of the Verified Complaint, and on that basis, denies the allegations of ¶ 17 of the Verified Complaint.

### **JURY DEMAND**

Defendant Prodprogramma hereby demands trial by jury of all issues triable by jury.

## **AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES**

# First Affirmative Defense

The Verified Complaint filed herein fails to state a claim against Defendant Prodprogramma upon which relief may be granted.

## **Second Affirmative Defense**

Plaintiff's claims against Defendant Prodprogramma are barred in whole or in part by the provisions of the terms and conditions applicable to the charter at issue, including, but not limited to, all limitations of liability contained therein.

# **Third Affirmative Defense**

The Verified Complaint fails to state a claim against Defendant Prodprogramma upon which relief can be granted because, *inter alia*, all disputes arising under the charter party agreements described in the Verified Complaint must be resolved through arbitration.

#### **Fourth Affirmative Defense**

Plaintiff's claims against Defendant Prodprogramma are barred in whole or in part by one or more of the doctrines of waiver, estoppel, laches and unclean hands.

## Fifth Affirmative Defense

Any loss suffered by Plaintiff, which is hereby specifically denied, was solely through the conduct and/or fault of Plaintiff and or others for whom Defendant Prodprogramma is not responsible, and was not caused by any fault of Defendant Prodprogramma.

#### **Sixth Affirmative Defense**

Plaintiff's claims for damages are barred and/or limited by its failure to mitigate damages.

## **Seventh Affirmative Defense**

Any damage suffered by Plaintiff, which is hereby specifically denied, was caused by an intervening and/or superseding cause, including, inter alia, force majeure, and was not caused by the acts or conduct of Defendant Prodprogramma, or any person for whom Defendant Prodprogramma is responsible.

# **Eighth Affirmative Defense**

Plaintiff has failed to perform all conditions precedent to any right of recovery on the claims set forth in Plaintiff's Verified Complaint.

## **Ninth Affirmative Defense**

Any damages suffered by Plaintiff, which are hereby specifically denied, were not proximately caused by the acts, conduct and/or omissions of Defendant Prodprogramma, or any person for whom Defendant Prodprogramma is responsible.

#### **Tenth Affirmative Defense**

This Court lacks personal jurisdiction over Defendant Prodprogramma.

WHEREFORE, Defendant Prodprogramma prays that this Court determine and adjudge that:

- A. the Verified Complaint be dismissed with prejudice;
- B. Plaintiff take nothing by way of damages or declaration:
- C. Defendant Prodprogramma be awarded its costs, disbursements, attorney fees and expenses incurred herein; and
- D. Defendant Prodprogramma be awarded such other and further relief as this Court deems just and proper.

Dated: New York, New York July 24, 2008

Respectfully submitted,

COOPER, BROWN & BEHRLE, P.C.

By:\_\_\_\_

Sandra Gale Behrle (SGB 4652)

331 Madison Avenue, Second Floor

New York, New York 10017 Telephone: 212.957-9000 Facsimile: 212.843-9191 Email: cbblaw@aol.com

David K. Monroe Galland Kharasch Greenberg Fellman & Swirsky, PC 1054 Thirty-First Street, NW Washington, DC 20007

Telephone: 202.342.5200 Facsimile: 202.342.5219 Email: dmonroe@gkglaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant Prodprogramma Impuls Ltd.

# CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I do hereby certify that I have delivered a true and correct copy of the foregoing document to the following addressee at the address stated by depositing same in the United States mail, first class postage prepaid, this 2% day of July, 2008:

Claurisse Campanale Orozco Thomas L. Tisdale TISDALE LAW OFFICES LLC 11 West 42<sup>nd</sup> Street – Suite 900

New York, NY 10036 Telephone: 212.354.0025 Facsimile: 212.869.0067

Email: <u>corozco@tisdale-law.com</u>

ttisdale@tisdale-law.com

Attorneys for Plaintiff Starlight Maritime Ltd.

~